



Community Advisory Panel (CAP) Meeting
Valero East – 610 Industrial Way, Benicia, CA - Drive to the back of the building
Tuesday, February 13, 2024 - 4:30 PM – 5:30 PM

AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER

Dennis Lowry called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm. Pam Fischer took roll of the committee. The following participants were in attendance for all or part of the meeting:

CAP Members

Dennis Lowry	CAP Chairman & Community at Large Member
Kari Birdseye	City of Benicia Council Member
Dr. Gethsemane Moss	Benicia Unified School District
Rod Sherry	Benicia Industrial Park Association
Marilyn Bardet (arrived late)	Good Neighbor Steering Committee
Teri Crosby	Community at Large Member
Cara Bateman (arrived late)	Community at Large Member

Valero CAP Representatives & Employees

Josh Tulino	VP and General Manager
Kim Ronan	HSE Director
Paul Adler	Director of Community Relations and Government Affairs
Melissa Manke Fimbres	Valero, Director Technical Services
Frank Hartig	Valero, Manager Plant Security
Pam Fischer	Valero, Executive Administrative Assistant

City Representatives

Chief Carl Littorno	Benicia Fire Department
Terry Scott	City Councilmember

Welcome

- Tonight's [Agenda](#) was approved & the 12/12/23 meeting [Minutes](#) were approved with unanimous approval after notation of correction in spelling of Teri Crosby's first name from Terry to Teri.

Refinery Update

- Josh Tulino, VP & General Manager - Josh voiced disappointment with the Benicia ISO process that was approved to go forward at the 12/19/23 City Council Meeting.
- Paul Adler, Community Relations & GA Director - Paul shared that in 2023, the refinery donated over \$2.4M towards community investment entities that primarily went to Benicia and neighboring communities. This total includes donations from United Way employee donations and the Corporate United Way match, Benefit for Children proceeds, Valero grants, and other local donations and sponsorships.

April Meeting Date Change Discussion - Neither Josh Tulino or Paul Adler will be available for the April 9th CAP Meeting. The committee was asked to select between Monday, April 15th and Tuesday, April 23rd. The 4 CAP members in attendance at that time selected Monday, April 15th as the date for the next meeting.

- Kim Ronan, HSE Director
 - Kim shared an HSE update for the year. There was only one minor employee incident & one contractor incident. There was also an environmental event that was caused by repairs made by a contractor to a tank owned by NuStar. In addition, there have been no process safety incidents in over a year.
 - Kim shared that the city received notifications from Valero for the following incidents:
 - January 15th - Flaring event due to power loss. The flaring volume was not necessary to report to the Air District. The refinery notified the city and the City issued a Level 1 notification onto the Public Information Bank. We also notified the county, who will be conducting an on-site visit to follow-up.
 - January 27th - Flaring event due to unit shut down. Made notification to the city, but they did not put out notification due to the flaring being less than 15 minutes.
 - Conoco Phillips' ship, the Polar Endeavor, had a leak of less than a gallon of red diesel; Valero responded with our Fire Department who quickly assisted with their cleanup.
- **Special Topics**
 - Valero Benicia Refinery – Regulatory Oversight Review – Kim Ronan – Valero Benicia Refinery's process to handle Title V Deviations & BAAQMD Notice of Violations (NOV).

Valero has a process to monitor ourselves and ensure compliance with the many requirements of our Title V permit. The overwhelming majority of NOVs that are issued to the refinery are those that we find and self-report through submission of a Title V deviation. There are also unannounced inspections that occur several times a month during which the Air District inspector may identify deviations. If Valero receives a Notice of Violation, Valero can respond to the violations, especially if they don't agree with the basis for the citation. The Air District then batches the violations into an annual bundle, and it can take a number of years until these NOVs are settled, typically with the payment of an agreed-to penalty.

Our 2023 Title V Deviations and NOVS were recapped: Benicia had 32 Title V deviations in 2023; 58 NOVs received. The numbers differ because some dated back to 2020 and earlier. Of the 58 issued, Valero disagreed with 30 and submitted written responses documenting our position. Josh Tulino added that due to these delays, these violations are not indicative of our current operations. Discussion was held around the cause of the delays at the Air District & that Chevron just settled 678 of these NOV's.

- Status Report on Public Engagement Plan for the Benicia Industrial Health & Safety Ordinance - Kari Birdseye and Terry Scott shared a presentation with a status report on the [Benicia City Council ISO Presentation](#) followed by discussion from Valero & the community.
- **Agenda Items that were tabled to the April 15, 2024 meeting**
 - 2023 Annual Report & 2024 CAP Goals/Work Plan Discussion – Tabled to next meeting
 - Nomination and election of the CAP Chairperson – Tabled to next meeting

2024 CAP Calendar

- Monday, April 15, 2024; 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm @ Valero East
- Tuesday, June 11th, 2024; 4:30 pm – 6:00 pm 'Community Information Night' @ Valero East
- Tuesday, August 13th, 2024; 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm @ Valero East
- Tuesday, October 8th, 2024; 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm @ Valero East
- Tuesday, December 10th, 2024; 4:30 pm – 6:00 pm 'Community Information Night' @ Valero East