



Community Advisory Panel (CAP) Meeting

Valero East – 610 Industrial Way, Benicia, CA

<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/88341592651?pwd=TzFaNIU4VENJellzcm9OVW5nb1lPZz09>

Tuesday, December 13, 2022 - 4:30 PM – 6:00 PM

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was conducted in person at Valero East and made available on a Zoom platform. Steve McClure called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm. The following CAP members, Valero employees and City of Benicia staff members attended the meeting. Names of the public in attendance and on Zoom were not included, however, 12 community members attended the in-person meeting and 8 community members signed onto the Zoom platform.

CAP Members – In- Person

Steve McClure	Benicia Chamber of Commerce
Diane Ferrucci	Benicia Unified School District
Dennis Lowry	Community at Large
Rod Sherry	Benicia Industrial Park Association

CAP Members - Attending using the Zoom platform

Marilyn Bardet	Good Neighbor Steering Committee
Neil Wilson	Community at Large
Amira Barger	Community at Large

Valero CAP Representatives – In- Person

Josh Tulino	VP and General Manager
Paul Adler	Director of Community Relations & Government Affairs
Kim Ronan	Director of Health, Safety, Environment and Regulatory Affairs

Valero employees – In- Person

Melissa Manke Fimbres	Valero, Director Technical Services
Frank Hartig	Valero, Manager Plant Security
Tara Wier	Valero, Manager Environmental Engineering
Pam Fischer	Valero, Executive Administrative Assistant

City Employees – In- Person

Chief Chadwick	Benicia Fire Department
----------------	-------------------------

Welcome

- Agenda was approved.
- The minutes from the [10/11/22 meeting](#) were approved and seconded by Rod Sherry - all members approved the meeting minutes.
- There was a moment of silence in memory of the recent passing of local Benicia long-time residents and CAP members, Tom Gavin and Bill Cawley.

CAP Member Updates

- Steve McClure – The Benicia Chamber of Commerce has no updates
- Diane Ferrucci – Benicia Unified School District is holding a special election for the Area 5 Board position.
- Rod Sherry – He was re-elected as the Benicia Industrial Park Association President for 2023. The BIPA Monthly meeting time will change to 11:30 am and be open to the public.
- Marilyn Bardet – Expressed appreciation for holding tonight's Zoom meeting and she was appreciative that the subject matter is about fence line monitoring.
- Neil Wilson – Looking forward to information on fence line monitoring as he feels this subject needs to be addressed.
- Dennis Lowry – He has been looking at ways to get information out to the community. Dennis sent out information using different social media platforms: Benicia Patch and had no responses; Next Door had 50 responses though mostly emojis with 38 comments. Some responses were dismissive, but Dennis explained what the purpose is of the Community Advisory Panel (CAP) and the CAP's desire to share information with the community. Dennis felt there is value in hosting this public forum and he will continue to promote and expand it on social media platforms. (Eg: Utilize Facebook)

Refinery Update

- Josh Tulino, Vice President & General Manager – The refinery's planned maintenance was completed and operations are back to normal; We are hoping to finish up the year safe and smoothly.
- Paul Adler, Community Relations & Government Affairs Director – The Benefit for Children (BFC) Award presentation was held last week. A handout was given detailing the nine organizations that received BFC grants. Paul also shared information regarding the CAP website: [Benicia CAP website](#) and referenced the Benicia Resident Resource postcard. Paul also commented that CAP Member changes are taking place. The terms for Steve McClure, Diane Ferrucci and Amira Barger end in 2023. Chris Ferrucci will represent the Benicia Chamber of Commerce and Gethsemane Moss will represent BUSD. Josh Tulino and City Manager Eric Upson will interview and select the one 'At Large' position in early 2023. Dennis Lowry will be acting as interim Chair until the next meeting, which will require a selection from the CAP about appointing a permanent Chair.
- Kim Ronan, Health, Safety, Environmental & Regulatory Affairs Director – Shared a PowerPoint presentation on H2S Fence Line Monitoring Update. Link: [Fence Line Presentation](#). Points articulated during the presentation included:
 - Valero has been actively working to meet the 12-15 Fenceline deadlines. Valero installed the Benzene, Toluene, Ethylbenzene, and Xylene (BTEX) and Sulfur Dioxide (SO₂) monitoring that met the 12-15 requirements and began submitting data for those components in 2021.
 - For Hydrogen Sulfide (H₂S), Valero installed state-of-the-art equipment in 2018 and has been continually working with its third-party contractor and the manufacturer to improve the detection limit of the system. The H₂S data began to be published on Valero's website in December 2022, but the equipment cannot reliably meet the new lower detection limit being imposed by the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) Some of the challenges of gathering data to meet the H₂S'MDL is that measurements of ambient air occur in an uncontrolled environment resulting in interferences.
 - Currently, Valero is only aware of one pathway that was part of a trial run at another facility that met BAAQMD's requirements for H₂S. However, Valero has not been provided data from that study, and therefore has not had the opportunity to evaluate that system. Additionally, that same brand of equipment is installed at another facility and, to Valero's knowledge, those paths have not been able to consistently comply with BAAQMD's requirements for H₂S. Therefore,

Valero has concluded that there is currently no proven, reliable path that would allow the refinery to meet the lower detection limit being set by the District, but is continuing to provide the best H2S fence line data available.

- Valero is continuing to work with the vendor and manufacturer to enhance its existing H2S system.

Questions and Answer from the audience

A transcript of the Questions & Answers commentary is available on line at [Benicia Voice Podcast](#).

Comments from City Staff & CAP Members

- Josh Chadwick, Benicia Fire Chief is working with BAAQMD to install another air monitor in the city at East Second Street where the old Benicia Fire Museum was located.
 - The new BAAQMD Community Air Monitor will be live in a couple of weeks and after 3 months of testing, reportable data will be available.
- Appreciation was given to both Steve McClure and Diane Ferrucci for their service as CAP members and for holding the meeting on Zoom. Steve and Diane also shared words of appreciation in working with the panel and their learnings.

2023 CAP Calendar

- Monday, February 13, 2023 – 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm
- Tuesday, April 11, 2023 – 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm
- Tuesday, June 13, 2023 – 4:30 – 6:00 pm – ‘Community Information Night’
- Tuesday, August 8, 2023 – 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm
- Tuesday, October 10, 2023 – 4:30 – 5:30 pm
- Tuesday, December 12, 2023 – 4:30 – 6:00 pm – ‘Community Information Night’