



**Community Advisory Panel (CAP) Meeting  
Valero East - 610 Industrial Way, Benicia, CA  
Tuesday, April 11 2023 - 4:30 PM – 5:30 PM**

**MINUTES**

**CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was conducted in person at Valero East. Dennis Lowry called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm. The following CAP members, Valero employees and City of Benicia staff members attended the meeting.

CAP Members

Dennis Lowry  
Chris Ferrucci  
Kari Birdseye  
Dr. Gethsemane Moss  
Marilyn Bardet  
Cara Bateman  
Teri Crosby

Community at Large  
Benicia Chamber of Commerce  
City of Benicia Council Member  
Benicia Unified School Board  
Good Neighbor Steering Committee  
Community at Large  
Community at Large

Valero CAP Representatives

Josh Tulino  
Paul Adler  
Taryn Wier

VP and General Manager  
Director of Community Relations & Government Affairs  
Environmental Manager

Valero employees

Frank Hartig  
Pam Fischer

Valero, Manager Plant Security  
Valero, Executive Administrative Assistant

City Employees

Captain Todd Matthews

Benicia Fire Department

Dennis Lowry submitted the motion to approve the April 11, 2023 agenda. It was seconded by Dr. Moss and approved unanimously. Motion made to submit the February 13, 2023 minutes as submitted was approved unanimously.

**Refinery Update**

- Josh Tulino, VP & General Manager
  - In February, there was an odor complaint around the Robert Semple School neighborhood. The Refinery, County and Fire Department conducted air monitoring and did not identify the source.
  - The refinery and EPA entered into a consent agreement due to incidents dating back to 2017 and 2019. Valero paid a penalty of \$1.224M and agreed to complete a number of action items requested by EPA. The agreed-to action items are not expected to have any impact on emissions or outside the fence concerns.
  - The refinery is adapting to the city's raw water pipeline that was punctured due to a mudslide along Lopes Road in Fairfield. Valero provided input and review regarding the assessment of the repair and damage. The refinery looked at options to reduce our water use. The City has done a great job managing the water line break and their

communication with the community. The current temporary water line will provide water to the city versus it being pulled from Lake Hermann.

- Paul Adler, Comm. Relations & Government Affairs Director
  - A Community Relations [eblast](#) was recently published. It highlighted the [CAP's Annual Report](#) that recapped last year's CAP activities and meetings. The E-Blast also provided updates of Valero's volunteer services and support in the community.
- Taryn Wier, Environmental Manager
  - Fenceline monitoring update – The air monitoring software is reading real time and is accessible on the <http://www.beniciarefineryairmonitors.org> website. It includes measurements of 3 open path fenceline systems and 3 ground level monitors. Earlier this year, the Bay Area refineries updated their [Air Monitoring Plans](#) to BAAQMD. The plan includes updates on the hydrogen sulfide monitoring that Valero began earlier this year. Valero's plan is posted on the [Air District's website](#) and is available for the public to read and make comments on through April 20<sup>th</sup>.
  - Marilyn Bardet has commented on the BAAQMD website on behalf of BCAMP. Discussion was held around how the monitors work relative to the weight of the gasses and placement of the monitors.

### **CAP Business Discussion**

- The CAP's mission goals are:
  - Study and know the culture of the Valero Benicia Refinery (how things are done, how they work)
  - Share information with the community as to what has been learned about Valero.
  - Listen to the concerns of the community and share them with Valero for possible action. This should be done at every opportunity.
- The meeting structure was updated last year to meet 6 times a year versus 4 and meetings will continue to be in person. Meetings will not be held virtually via Zoom or Skype. Meeting material will be available on the CAP's website and agendas will focus on refinery operations.
- All meetings will last for one hour. The Community Information Nights is open to the public and will be 1½ hours long.
- Dennis Lowry shared a Lexicon handout, which is an interpretation of the terms used in monitoring and reporting. This handout can be used and updated as necessary.
- Discussion occurred about potential topics for the June 13<sup>th</sup> 'Community Information Night' meeting.
  - Dennis suggested the topics be concise and focus on understanding the air monitoring programs managed by Valero and then be dovetailed with BCAMP systems.
  - Another possible topic that was suggested by Cara Bateman inquired about the level of mistrust with Valero's communication with the community. This concern could include detailing the communication processes from the City of Benicia, the Benicia Fire Department and Valero.
  - Raising awareness of what actions need to be taken and what air monitoring equipment is available as part of an "Incident Response" discussion.
  - Valero uses the city's [Public Information Bank](#) to act as a database that can inform the public about incident investigations and inspections.
  - Other topics that surfaced focused on disclosing a timeline of scheduled maintenance and turnarounds so that if flaring, noise, smoke, etc will occur, the public could be aware in advance.
  - Teri Crosby also suggested that Valero continue to highlight investments that they make to improve our community.

## **CAP Member Updates**

- Dennis Lowry – Chair & ‘At Large’ Member
  - If CAP members have ideas for the agenda, please send text messages to Dennis and he + Paul will work out the agenda from their ideas. One future topic he suggests is to review Valero’s water usage and treatment plant.
- Marilyn Bardet – Good Neighbor Steering Committee
  - She inquired about the Wet Gas Scrubber because an incident occurred at a refinery in Martinez and since Valero has a WGS would that control device have prevented a similar incident from occurring? She noted that sprinkles of shiny stuff from the release were left on vehicles of Martinez residents.
  - Marilyn also inquired about who owns the tank farms? Josh explained that some of the tank farms are owned by Nustar. She would like to know the location of those tanks owned by Nustar and was wondering about their relationship to NuStar’s facility in Rodeo. Josh described the location of Nustar tanks that exist in Benicia and that additional information will be provided to Marilyn.
  - Cara Bateman pointed out that Valero’s relationship with Nustar has no correlation to the Rodeo incident.
- Cara Bateman – ‘At Large’ Member
  - Cara noted that Benicia residents are concerned about Valero’s 2021 release after the Martinez Refinery incident that recently occurred. There were some residents trying to stir up the community and she was able to explain the differences between the two incidents along with the control device that Valero has installed.
- Kari Birdseye - City of Benicia Council Member
  - The City is very thankful for Valero’s partnership with the water line’s conservation efforts .Although Lake Hermann looks full to capacity, the water conservation plan is still in place. Thanks to Valero and the community for their patience. Public Works employees recently received raises which helped to keep PW Staff in their positions to manage the project very effectively.
  - Finally, Kari reminded CAP attendees that the city is experiencing serious budget issues.
- Teri Crosby – ‘At Large’ Member - No report at this time.
- Chris Ferrucci – Benicia Chamber of Commerce
  - May 19<sup>th</sup> is the Chamber’s Golf Tournament.
- Dr. Gethsemane Moss – Benicia Unified School District
  - The District is hiring for administrative positions and all entities are dealing with an unfortunate game called ‘La Migra’ that’s being played by students. This game is offensive to many members of the community and a safety concern.
  - The election is being held today for the School Board’s Trustee seat in District 5.
- Rod Sherry, Benicia Industrial Park Association
  - Last month’s BIPA meeting included a presentation on the Northgate study (Seeno property)

Meeting adjourned at 5:30 pm

### **2023 Calendar**

- Tuesday, June 13, 2023 – 4:30 – 6:00 pm – ‘Community Information Night’
- Tuesday, August 8, 2023 – 4:30 pm – 5:30 pm – Refinery Tour for CAP members
- Tuesday, October 10, 2023 – 4:30 – 5:30 pm
- Tuesday, December 12, 2023 – 4:30 – 6:00 pm – ‘Community Information Night’